



# County of San Diego

#### **DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE**

5201 RUFFIN ROAD, SUITE B, SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123-1666 **INFORMATION (858) 694-2960** TOLL FREE (800) 411-0017

#### SAN MARCOS OFFICE

338 VIA VERA CRUZ • SUITE 201 SAN MARCOS, CA 92069-2620 (760) 471-0730

#### **EL CAJON OFFICE**

200 EAST MAIN ST. • SIXTH FLOOR EL CAJON, CA 92020-3912 (619) 441-4030

## **BOARD MINUTES**

HISTORIC SITE BOARD November 21, 2005

**Staff Present:** 

Glenn Russell

Donna Beddow

Gail Wright

DRAFT

## **ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

#### ITEM 1 – ADMINISTRATIVE

- A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information
  - Call to Order

PM

**Members Present:** 

Paul Johnson Vicki Estrada Jim Royle Margie Warner Eldonna Lay

**Members Absent:** 

Carmen Lucas

**Other General Information** 

None

- B. Conflict of Interest Declaration None
- C. Approval of October 17, 2005 Board Minutes

Vicki Estrada moved that the minutes of the 10/17/2005 meeting be approved.

2<sup>nd</sup> by Margie Warner.

Motion carried 4-0-1 (Jim Royle abstained)

## Approval of November 3, 2005 Special Meeting Minutes

Paul Johnson moved that the minutes of the 11/3/2005 meeting be approved as amended. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Margie Warner

Motion carried 4-0-1 (Vicki Estrada abstained)

#### D. Reports:

30<sup>th</sup> Annual San Diego Museum of Man Rock Art 2005 Seminar was held at Balboa Park. Fourteen papers were presented related to rock art worldwide including an introductory tribute to San Diego archaeological pioneer Malcolm Rogers, one of the first to record rock art sites in the County. The most important of the papers was "Rock Art Destruction Marches On – Is There a Silver Lining?" by Steve Freers. A Riverside County rock art site was destroyed during the course of development. I would like to bring Steve Freers to present this program to the HSB early next year. Jim Royle also attended the seminar; he mentioned that site destruction was related to our discussion last month about the County of San Diego's demolition process that needs to be updated. NOTE: Copies of demolition processes from other jurisdictions including the City of San Diego, Los Angeles, and Escondido were given to Board members, all of which contain provisions to check for historic, or potentially historic structures.

- Archaeological Resources Protection Act Seminar November 9 and 10, 2005, put on by the BIA and US Forest Service.
- Ferry Ranch House (MAA 05-002) update on property Rezone; ready to go to the planning commission December 16<sup>th</sup> then on to the Board of Supervisors.

#### E. Announcements

- San Diego County Archaeological Society (SDCAS) meeting November 22, 2005 at 7:30pm, Alex Bevil, State Parks Historian will present the program: "The History of the Airplane Monument on Cuyamaca Mountain".
- Citizens Coordinate for Century 3; December 1, 2005
- "Christmas in the Clouds" First Native American romantic Comedy a Movie

## ITEM 2 – PUBLIC COMMENTS/PRESENTATIONS

- A. Public Comment None
- B. Presentations None
- C. County Department of Parks and Recreation: No update

#### **ACTION ITEMS**

#### ITEM 3 – THE HARE HOUSE IN LA MESA - MAA 05-007

**Applicant/Owner:** Darin & Catherine Simmerman

**Location**: 9150 Wister Drive, La Mesa, CA 91941; APN 491-800-05

Community Planning Group: Valle de Oro Supervisor District: Valle de Oro 2 – Dianne Jacob

**Description:** The Hare House, constructed in 1939 by Dan Gudmundson, is an important example of the Spanish Eclectic Style of homes built in the late 1930's featuring a cross-gabled red Mission tile roof and a stucco exterior. Many owners of this house served in the US armed forces. Theron Hare, who had the house built, served for 34 years in the US Navy. Natalie Gale, who emigrated from Italy, owned the house from 1943 until her death in 1976 and gave the house to the US Government because she was so grateful to this country for the opportunities she has enjoyed here. The US Government auctioned the house in 1980. The home is a symbol of the patriotic servicemen who lived here and is significant for its architecture.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend placement of this resource on the Local Register of Historic Resources and for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

**Meeting notes**: Owners Cathy and Darin Simmerman attended the meeting and were available for questions; owner representative Myrna Marston presented background on the Hare house.

**Board Action:** Motion by Margie Warner to recommend placement of the Hare House, including the garage and rock wall, on the Local Register of Historic Resources and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

2<sup>nd</sup> by Eldonna Lay Motion carried 5-0-0

## ITEM 4 - GLENN E. MURDOCK HOUSE MAA 05-008

**Applicant:** Pamela Bensoussan, Owner's agent **Owner**: David G. Kesner, Sheila K. Dowe

**Location**: 9441 Sunset Avenue, La Mesa, CA 91941; APN 491-462-01 and 02

**Community Planning Group**: Valle de Oro **Supervisor District**: 2 - Dianne Jacob

**Description:** The Glenn E. Murdock house is a two-story Dutch cottage style home constructed around 1946, designed by owners Helen and William Lainson who intended to evoke the cottage style architecture of their native Norway. The house, ancillary buildings and grounds comprise two parcels totaling 0.76 acres situated on the north slope of Grossmont Mountain. Ed Fletcher and William Gross and members of the Grossmont Artist Colony first settled this area at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. This house is significant because it is associated with a prominent local educator Glenn E. Murdock, Superintendent of La Mesa/Spring Valley School District for 24 years, and for its association with Roland S. Hoyt, a renowned landscape architect and prominent author/horticulturalist. The house is also significant for its architecture, a vernacular Dutch cottage style architecture and important landscape architecture. Additionally, the house is significant because it was a part of, and represents a continuation of the early development of Grossmont Mountain by its first residents.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend placement of this house and landscape on the Local Register of Historic Resources and for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

**Meeting notes:** Property Owners Cathy and Darin Simmerman attended the meeting and were available for questions; owner agent Pamela Bensoussan talked about interviewing Mrs. Murdock who, at 99 years of age, provided much of the background information included in the historical report.

**Board Action:** Motion by Paul Johnson to recommend placement of the Glenn E. Murdock House, including the landscape, lath house and outbuildings, rock walls, paths and steps and exterior rock fireplace, on the Local Register of Historic Resources and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

2<sup>nd</sup> by Margie Warner Motion carried 5-0-0

#### ITEM 5 – Marie Schumann-Heink & Hubert Guy Residence MAA 05-009

**Applicant:** Scott A. Moomijan

Owner: Thomas and Tawnya Macchiarella

**Location**: 5310 Valle Vista Avenue, La Mesa, Ca 91941, APN 491-440-13, 15 and 16

**Community Planning Group**: Valle de Oro **Supervisor District**: 2 - Dianne Jacob

<u>Description</u>: The Marie Schumann-Heink & Hubert Guy Residence is a one-story single family home designed in a Swiss Chalet architectural style by noted architects William Henry Wheeler and Robert Halley Jr., in 1916 for Marie Schumann-Heink and Hubert Guy at the request of world Opera Diva Madame Ernestine Schumann-Heink for her daughter Marie who was to marry Mr. Hubert Guy, a prominent poultry rancher in El Cajon. Adam Georgia built the home under the guidance of Colonel E. Fletcher and William B. Gross who had owned the property. Historic research indicates that this residence is both historically and architecturally significant as it embodies distinctive characterizes of an unusual architectural type not found elsewhere in the Mt. Helix La Mesa area, the Swiss Chalet, designed by noted architect William Henry Wheeler as well as its association with individuals important to the history of the Mt. Helix/La mesa community.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend placement of this house on the Local Register of Historic Resources and for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

**Meeting Notes:** Property Owner Thomas Macciarella attended the meeting and was available for questions; owner representative Scott A. Moomjian provided additional description and background regarding the historic residence.

**Board Action**: Motion by Paul Johnson to continue this application until the December HSB meeting. Scott Moomjian will be providing staff with additional support information including a site plan. The additional documentation will be distributed to the Board as soon as possible. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Eldonna Lay Motion carried 5-0-0

#### ITEM 6 – LAKE CUYAMACA/EDWARDS STONE HOUSE – MAA 05-001

**Applicant:** Scott A. Moomjian

Owner: Mr. Evan Edwards Family Trust

**Location**: 34571 Engineers Road, Julian, Ca 92036, APN 294-070-16

Community Planning Group: Cuyamaca/Central Mountain

**Supervisor District**: 2 - Dianne Jacob

<u>Description</u>: The Lake Cuyamaca/Edwards Stone House in Julian was designed and/or constructed by an unknown architect and/or builder in 1928. The house represents a stone vernacular Craftsman example and was one of only several residential structures built within the Lake Cuyamaca area during the 1920's-1930's period. Today, the building is the oldest, if not the last, remaining residential structure that dates to this period in the Lake Cuyamaca area. Over the years, the property was owned by a number of different individuals, including the noted Colonel Ed Fletcher. Historical research indicates that this property is both historically and architecturally significant. The residence is historically significant as a building that represents a contribution to the broad pattern of San Diego County's rural east county development as well as the development of the Lake Cuyamaca region and its cultural heritage. The residence is architecturally significant as it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period of San Diego County region and method of late 1920's vernacular stone Craftsman construction.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend placement of this house on the Local Register of Historic Resources and for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

**Meeting Notes:** Owner representative Scott A. Moomjian provided additional description and background regarding the historic residence. Property owner Evan Edwards was available to answer questions. Bruce Coons, Save Our Heritage Organization (SOHO) spoke in support of

listing the Edwards Rock house on the County register. Mr. Moomjian will revise the Rehabilitation table and submit to staff.

**Board Action**: Motion by Vicki Estrada to recommend placement of the Lake Cuyamaca/Edwards House, including the stone water tower and Native American archaeological site, on the Local Register of Historic Resources and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act Contract.

2<sup>nd</sup> by Jim Royle Motion carried 5-0-0

#### **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

#### ITEM 7 – JULIAN ELTINGE HOMESTEAD – MAA 05-003

**Applicant/Owner:** Mark Whittleton

**Location**: 2690 South Grade Road, Alpine, CA 91901

Community Planning Group: Alpine Supervisor District: 2 – Dianne Jacob

<u>Description</u>: The Julian Eltinge Homestead was listed as historic and eligible for participation in the Mills Act by the Director of Planning and Land Use on August 30, 2005. The Historic Site Board on recommended approval of historic listing and participation in the Mills Act for this resource on June 20, 2005. The applicant desires to change out the existing metal windows to wood frame windows, and as such must present the change to the Historic Site Board for review. Because this item was not noticed, an action on this item cannot take place until the December 19, 2005 meeting.

**Staff Recommendation:** Recommend approval of the change in windows from metal frame to wood frame.

**Board Action:** Recommend approval of the change in windows from metal frame to wood frame.

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

## <u>ITEM 8 – HSB PROCEDURE: INFORMATION REQUIRED FOR LANDMARKING APPLICATIONS.</u>

<u>Discussion:</u> One of the HSB goals for 2005 was to develop requirements for landmarking to provide potential applicants with the necessary information that is needed for the Board to make decisions. Board members and staff, based on experiences relating to the projects discussed during the current meeting, recommended several additions.

## **OTHER**

#### ITEM 9 – FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Next meeting will take place on Monday, December 19, 2005
- Action item: Santee Town Center MEIR, Edgemoor Farm Historic District.
- Action item: Marie Schumann-Heink & Hubert Guy Residence

## ITEM 9 – ADJOURNMENT

APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES:	
Chairman, Jim Royle	<u>December 19, 2005</u>
Vice-Chairman, Paul Johnson	<u>December 19, 2005</u>